

MINUTES APPROVED AT THE DRB MEETING ON SEPTEMBER 25, 2019

**DESIGN REVIEW BOARD REGULAR MEETING
Multi-Purpose Room, Community Services Building, Basement Level
440 Civic Center Plaza, Richmond CA 94804**

August 28, 2019
6:00 P.M.

BOARD MEMBERS

Kimberly Butt
Michael Hannah
Jonathan Livingston

Jessica Fine
Macy Leung
Karlyn Neel

Chair Livingston called the meeting to order at 6:03 P.M.

ROLL CALL

Present: Chair Jonathan Livingston, Vice Chair Michael Hannah, and Boardmembers Kimberly Butt, Jessica Fine, and Macy Leung

Absent: Boardmember Karlyn Neel

INTRODUCTIONS

Staff Present: Planners Emily Carroll, Roberta Feliciano, and Hector Lopez; and City Attorney James Atencio

APPROVAL OF MINUTES: None

APPROVAL OF AGENDA

Public Forum

CORDELL HINDLER, Richmond, referred to the Aspire Academy, which the Design Review Board (DRB) had approved some time ago, and stated the Fairmede-Hilltop Neighborhood Council had not been aware of the project. He reiterated the need for applicants to make a presentation to the applicable Neighborhood Council prior to any action taken by the DRB.

City Council Liaison Report

CONSENT CALENDAR:

Chair Livingston announced that any decision approved may be appealed in writing to the City Clerk within ten (10) days, or by Monday, September 10, 2019 by 5:00 P.M. and he announced it after each affected item.

PUBLIC HEARINGS:

- 1. PLN18-358**
Description **ISLAMIC SOCIETY MOSQUE RENOVATION AND ADDITION**
PUBLIC HEARING TO CONSIDER A DESIGN REVIEW PERMIT FOR RENOVATION AND CONSTRUCTION OF A 2,500 SQUARE FOOT ADDITION TO AN EXISTING MOSQUE.

MINUTES APPROVED AT THE DRB MEETING ON SEPTEMBER 25, 2019

Location	1110 36 TH STREET
APN	526-030-012
Zoning	RL-2, SINGLE-FAMILY LOW DENSITY RESIDENTIAL DISTRICT
Applicant	ISLAMIC SOCIETY OF WEST CONTRA COSTA COUNTY (OWNER)
Staff Contact	JONELYN WHALES Recommendation: CONTINUE TO SEPTEMBER 11, 2019

The application was continued to the September 11, 2019 meeting.

- 2. PLN19-199 BLANDON TWO-STORY ADDITION**
- | | | |
|---------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------|
| Description | PUBLIC HEARING TO CONSIDER A REQUEST FOR A DESIGN REVIEW PERMIT TO CONSTRUCT A NEW TWO-STORY ±370 SQUARE FOOT ADDITION TO AN EXISTING SINGLE-FAMILY RESIDENCE. | |
| Location | 621 7 TH STREET | |
| APN | 534-193-006 | |
| Zoning | RL-2, SINGLE-FAMILY LOW DENSITY RESIDENTIAL DISTRICT | |
| Owner | ENRIQUE BLANDON | |
| Applicant | BACILIA MACIAS | |
| Staff Contact | EMILY CARROLL | Recommendation: CONDITIONAL APPROVAL |

Emily Carroll presented the staff report dated August 28, 2019, for a relatively small second-story addition to a home built in 1912, which would include a master bedroom and an expansion of the pantry and kitchen area, and expand into the rear yard to create a small deck. Staff had recommended that the applicant replace the fencing along 6th and 7th Streets to be more compatible with the residence; unify the window styles and dimensions to achieve a more cohesive look; and add a trellis on the rear elevation with some vining plant to soften the rear façade. She added that the applicant would be replacing the materials on the entire structure.

Chair Livingston opened the public hearing.

BACILIA MACIAS, the applicant, stated that the existing siding would be replaced, the addition would match the style of the house with the outriggers and gable vents, and the windows would be simple with a casement. She agreed with the staff request for a trellis on the rear deck.

Boardmember Fine referred to the front (east) elevation and appreciated the window changes but sought something more conservative to balance the size and shape of the windows. She also noted there appeared to be a lack of symmetry.

Ms. Macias commented that there was a height issue on that elevation and a desire to center the gable ridges. There was also a desire to minimize the windows off of the street, particularly 7th Street which was a busy street.

Boardmember Hannah commented that the second story was pretty far back. He suggested that two side-by-side windows might create a more balanced appearance. He recommended a duplicate window on the rear elevation in the stairs and also suggested that the trellis wrap around to break the tall two-story element. He drew a sketch of what he recommended.

After the discussion, Ms. Macias offered to create a simplified roof to have both plates be the same height with the ridge centered between the two walls or raise the plate height. She also agreed with the suggestion to wrap the trellis across the rear elevation to engage the long tall wall to help reduce the mass.

MINUTES APPROVED AT THE DRB MEETING ON SEPTEMBER 25, 2019

The DRB requested that the proposed color be “desaturated.”

Chair Livingston closed the public hearing.

ACTION: It was M/S/C (Hannah/Fine) to approve PLN19-199, Blandon Two-Story Addition, subject to the four Findings and Statements of Fact with 12 Conditions of Approval, and additional DRB conditions pursuant to Exhibit A from Boardmember Hannah, as follows: 13) Mirror the upper window in the rear; 14) Readjust the geometry of the roof pitch and plate height of the addition and remove the split pitch and resolve some of the centering; 15) Look at the front elevation of the second-story addition and with the new plate height resolve the windows to create a more balanced elevation with the recognition that it was very far back; 16) Wrap the trellis in the rear of the west elevation to break up the two-story element; and 17) Desaturate the color palette to tone down the yellow and conduct some test painting; approved by voice vote: 5-0 (Ayes: Butt, Fine, Hannah, Leung, and Livingston; Noes: None; Absent: Neel).

3. PLN19-099	DECK ALTERATION
Description	PUBLIC HEARING TO CONSIDER A REQUEST FOR A DESIGN REVIEW PERMIT TO EXPAND AN EXISTING DECK GREATER THAN FOUR FEET IN HEIGHT.
Location	527 WASHINGTON AVENUE
APN	558-052-001
Zoning	RL-2, SINGLE-FAMILY LOW DENSITY RESIDENTIAL DISTRICT
Applicant	RUDIE MATTHEW (OWNER)
Staff Contact	EMILY CARROLL
	Recommendation: CONDITIONAL APPROVAL

Emily Carroll presented the staff report dated August 28, 2019, to rebuild a relatively private deck at the corner of Washington and Bishop Avenues that would have no impacts on the neighbors, and that had been approved by the neighbors and the Point Richmond Neighborhood Council. Staff recommended approval of the application.

Chair Livingston opened the public hearing.

RUDIE MATTHEW, the applicant, reported that the 45-degree wood angles would be eliminated because they obstructed the view and a metal gusset or small bucket designed by a structural engineer would be considered.

Boardmember Hannah had no issues with the application.

Chair Livingston suggested the trellis would look better if there was a bigger post, and Boardmember Hannah recommended a 6x6 foot minimum size. He also recommended that the cable rails be stainless to avoid rust.

Chair Livingston closed the public hearing.

ACTION: It was M/S/C (Hannah/Fine) to approve PLN19-099, Deck Alteration, subject to the four Findings and Statements of Fact with 6 Conditions of Approval, and additional DRB conditions as follows: 7) The diagonal braces not to be included in the design as intended and discussed pursuant to Exhibit A from Boardmember Hannah; 8) Cable rails to be stainless steel and non-corrosive; 9) Exhibit A submitted as a structural suggestion as to how to brace the diaphragm of the decks without visible brackets; and 10) All new exterior lighting to be shielded pursuant to the staff conditions of approval for shielded

MINUTES APPROVED AT THE DRB MEETING ON SEPTEMBER 25, 2019

light and LED no more than 3,000k; approved by voice vote: 5-0 (Ayes: Butt, Fine, Hannah, Leung, and Livingston; Noes: None; Absent: Neel).

4. **PLN19-149** **NEW SINGLE-FAMILY RESIDENCE AND ADU**
Description PUBLIC HEARING TO CONSIDER A REQUEST FOR A DESIGN REVIEW PERMIT TO CONSTRUCT A $\pm 1,784$ SQUARE FOOT TWO-STORY SINGLE-FAMILY RESIDENCE WITH A DETACHED ± 483 SQUARE FOOT ACCESSORY DWELLING UNIT (ADU) ON A VACANT PARCEL.
Location 9TH STREET (APPROXIMATELY 50 FEET NORTHEAST FROM THE CORNER OF RIPLEY AVENUE AND 9TH STREET)
APN 534-181-025 AND -026
Zoning RM-1, MEDIUM DENSITY MULTI-FAMILY RESIDENTIAL DISTRICT
Applicant TIMOTHY CARTER (OWNER)
Staff Contact JONELYN WHALES Recommendation: **CONTINUE TO SEPTEMBER 11, 2019**

The application was continued to the September 11, 2019 meeting.

5. **PLN19-143 & PLN 19-144** **COLEMAN TWO SINGLE-FAMILY RESIDENCES AND ADUs**
Description STUDY SESSION TO PROVIDE AND RECEIVE COMMENTS ON THE PROPOSED DESIGN OF TWO $\pm 1,342$ SQUARE FOOT SINGLE-FAMILY RESIDENCES WITH ± 515 SQUARE FOOT ACCESSORY DWELLING UNITS ON TWO RECONFIGURED PARCELS.
Location YORK STREET (VACANT PARCELS NORTH OF YORK STREET AND WILLARD AVENUE)
APN 561-151-027 TO -029
Zoning RL-2, SINGLE-FAMILY LOW DENSITY RESIDENTIAL DISTRICT
Applicant VERONICA COLEMAN (OWNER)
Staff Contact ROBERTA FELICIANO Recommendation: **PROVIDE & RECEIVE COMMENTS**

Roberta Feliciano presented the staff report dated August 28, 2019 for two separate projects, each proposing a single-family residence and ADU on three lots that had been reconfigured into two lots to meet the minimum lot size for the zoning district. She expressed staff's concerns with the roofline, consistent materials, porch, elevations, and the landscape plan. She added that the Shields-Reid Neighborhood Council had provided a letter of support.

COURTNEY MILLER, Architect, referred to the staff comment that the roofline was out of character. He described the intent for a contemporary design and for the roof of each unit to mirror each other, although he had since reduced the angle of the rooflines to bring them down. As a result, the garage was now flat.

JOURNEY AQUARIAN, representing the applicant, spoke to the rooflines and the desire for something new and exciting.

Boardmember Hannah had no problem with the rooflines and commented that reducing the pitch and making everything below the upper level perceived flat was nice and he liked the perceived butterfly effect of the two buildings. He suggested that the two roofs be distinct in color and that high quality materials be considered to create the type of homes desired in Richmond.

Boardmember Fine agreed, liked the contemporary architecture, wanted to see the overhang on

MINUTES APPROVED AT THE DRB MEETING ON SEPTEMBER 25, 2019

the garage match the other roof overhang, and sought careful attention to the facade of the main house and the ADU given that privacy would be important. She recommended an additional tree to the right of the concrete patio to help with screening.

Boardmember Butt had no issues with modern architecture in the neighborhood given that it was not a historic neighborhood and included various decades of architecture. She liked the colors.

Boardmember Hannah recommended the use of custom wood, old-style architectural modern windows such as those produced by Loewen Wood Windows that were nice, cost effective, and appeared to be custom architecture.

Chair Livingston liked the architecture and asked if there could be some play of the geometries in the relationship of the two units and potentially reverse the roof angles to avoid a mirror image.

Boardmember Hannah disagreed and liked the layout and the transitional modern, and a discussion developed on whether that element was a concern.

Mr. Miller confirmed the colors that had been proposed for each home and the DRB accepted the colors as submitted.

Chair Livingston recommended that the proposed PVC gutters and downspouts be replaced with galvanized painted bonderized gutters and downspouts, and Boardmember Fine requested that the applicant consider a downspout at the garage entry.

The DRB commended the proposal as a great addition to the neighborhood.

Board Business

A. Staff reports, requests, or announcements:

There were no staff reports, requests, or announcements.

B. Boardmember reports, requests, or announcements:

Boardmember Hannah referred to his offer of assistance to the applicant for PLN19-069 and reported that the architect had indicated that the proposal would be refined to respond to the DRB's comments and be returned with revised plans.

Chair Livingston noted that Boardmember Fine had taken notes of the DRB's policy discussion to ensure compliance with conditions at the last meeting and had prepared a summary that would be forwarded to staff and the Mayor, who would discuss recommendations and draft a policy resolution that would be submitted to the DRB for consideration at a future meeting.

Boardmember Fine described a conversation she had with a City of Oakland planner who had identified some of the issues related to process that would be helpful for the DRB in its efforts to address the issues with respect to non-compliance with approved conditions of approval. At the request of the Chair and for the benefit of Boardmember Leung who was not available at the last meeting, she highlighted the DRB's discussion of that topic.

DRB Members also highlighted the status of some current and future projects.

MINUTES APPROVED AT THE DRB MEETING ON SEPTEMBER 25, 2019

Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned at 7:32 P.M. to the next regular Design Review Board meeting on Wednesday, September 11, 2019.