

# MINUTES APPROVED AT THE DRB MEETING ON AUGUST 22, 2018

DESIGN REVIEW BOARD REGULAR MEETING  
Multi-Purpose Room, Community Services Building, Basement Level  
440 Civic Center Plaza, Richmond CA 94804  
August 8, 2018  
6:00 P.M.

## BOARD MEMBERS

Meredith Benz  
Michael Hannah  
Tom Leader  
Karlyn Neel

Kimberly Butt  
Bhavin Khatri  
Jonathan Livingston

Chair Livingston called the meeting to order at 6:03 P.M.

## ROLL CALL

**Present:** Chair Jonathan Livingston, Vice Chair Tom Leader, and Boardmembers Michael Hannah, and Karlyn Neel  
**Absent:** Boardmembers Meredith Benz, Kimberly Butt, and Bhavin Khatri

## INTRODUCTIONS

**Staff Present:** Planners Jonelyn Whales, Roberta Feliciano, and City Attorney Shannon Moore

**APPROVAL OF MINUTES:** June 27, 2018 and July 25, 2018

<b>ACTION:</b> It was M/S/C (Hannah/Leader) to approve the minutes of the June 27, 2018 and July 25, 2018 meetings, as submitted; approved by voice vote: 4-0 (Ayes: Hannah, Leader, Livingston, and Neel; Noes: None; Absent: Benz, Butt, and Khatri).
---

## APPROVAL OF AGENDA

### Public Forum

CORDELL HINDLER, Richmond, reported there had yet been no correspondence between McDonald's and the North and East Neighborhood Councils and the 23<sup>rd</sup> Street Merchants Association related to PLN 18-023 (McDonald's Façade Renovation); nor had there been a presentation to the Hilltop District Council for the athletic facility near the Hilltop area. He also reported that no traffic study had yet been prepared for PLN17-436, Valmar Laundromat, which was important given the congestion and accidents that had occurred in that area.

**City Council Liaison Report** – Mayor Butt was not present.

**CONSENT CALENDAR:** None

Chair Livingston announced that any decision approved may be appealed in writing to the City Clerk within ten (10) days, or by Monday, August 20, 2018 by 5:00 P.M. and he announced it after each affected item.

## PUBLIC HEARINGS:

## MINUTES APPROVED AT THE DRB MEETING ON AUGUST 22, 2018

Both PLN18-015 and PLN18-016 were continued to the meeting on August 22, 2018.

- 1. PLN18-015                    SMART NEW RESIDENCE**  
Description                    **(HELD OVER FROM AUGUST 8, 2018)** PUBLIC HEARING TO CONSIDER A REQUEST FOR A DESIGN REVIEW PERMIT TO CONSTRUCT A ±2,600 SQUARE FOOT TWO-STORY RESIDENCE ON AN ±8,700 SQUARE FOOT VACANT PARCEL.  
Location                        70 BELVEDERE AVENUE  
APN                                558-012-015  
Zoning                            RL-1, SINGLE-FAMILY VERY LOW DENSITY RESIDENTIAL DISTRICT  
Owner                            AARON SMART  
Applicant                        ROGER KURATH, DESIGN 21, LLC  
Staff Contact                    HECTOR LOPEZ    Recommendation: **CONTINUE TO AUGUST 22, 2018**
- 2. PLN18-016                    SMART NEW RESIDENCE**  
Description                    **(HELD OVER FROM AUGUST 8, 2018)** PUBLIC HEARING TO CONSIDER A REQUEST FOR A DESIGN REVIEW PERMIT TO CONSTRUCT A ±2,800 SQUARE FOOT TWO-STORY RESIDENCE ON A ±9,850 SQUARE FOOT VACANT PARCEL.  
Location                        80 BELVEDERE AVENUE  
APN                                558-012-014  
Zoning                            RL-1, SINGLE-FAMILY LOW DENSITY RESIDENTIAL DISTRICT  
Owner                            AARON SMART  
Applicant                        ROGER KURATH, DESIGN 21, LLC  
Staff Contact                    HECTOR LOPEZ    Recommendation: **CONTINUE TO AUGUST 22, 2018**
- 3. PLN18-053                    SELF-STORAGE AND ARTIST STUDIOS BUILDING**  
Description                    PUBLIC HEARING TO CONSIDER A RECOMMENDATION TO THE PLANNING COMMISSION OF A DESIGN REVIEW PERMIT TO CONSTRUCT AN 80,916 SQUARE FOOT BUILDING FOR MINI-STORAGE AND ARTIST STUDIOS AT THE WHALE POINT MARINE AND HARDWARE SITE.  
Location                        205 CUTTING BOULEVARD  
APN                                550-102-022  
Zoning                            IL, INDUSTRIAL LIGHT  
Owner                            LOUIS A WINDHURST III  
Applicant                        NOLAN BORDEN (BARANOF HOLDINGS)  
Staff Contact                    ROBERTA FELICIANO    **RECOMMENDATION TO PLANNING COMMISSION**

Chair Livingston thanked the applicant and his team for working with the DRB Subcommittee which had served as a great example of making something better.

Roberta Feliciano presented the staff report dated August 8, 2018 for a self-storage and artist studio building on Cutting Boulevard on a 1.07 acre through parcel currently the home of Whale Point Marine and Hardware, a building that would be demolished to allow the construction of a three-story CMU building for the self-storage and artist studios. A DRB Study Session on April 25, 2018 had referred the application to the DRB Subcommittee to revise the design to activate the Cutting Boulevard frontage and add the artist studios to the Cutting Boulevard side of the site. Several iterations had been developed in that process.

Chair Livingston opened the public hearing.

## MINUTES APPROVED AT THE DRB MEETING ON AUGUST 22, 2018

Nolan Borden, Vice President of Baranof Holdings and Dennis Edgett of Ware Malcomb, the Architect; and Zico Saryeddean of Kier & Wright Civil Engineers, presented the original rendition along with the latest iteration of the proposal that had been under review by the DRB Subcommittee since the April Study Session. The DRB had directed the applicant to tone down the green color, provide more articulation along Cutting Boulevard, address the lack of depth and variation between the corrugated metal and the aluminum, activate Cutting Boulevard and move the artist studios to the south elevation, use design inspiration from Tom Kundig, utilize the palm tree farms to the north, and remove the visibility of storage doors along the Cutting Boulevard elevation. He presented the latest iteration and described the changes that had been made to incorporate the DRB Subcommittee's comments.

Chair Livingston requested information on the details related to the trash enclosure, the fencing that was reportedly to be wrought iron black, and light specifications.

### Public Comments:

CORDELL HINDLER, Richmond, reported that the project had been considered by the Santa Fe Neighborhood Council in May 2018, and while he liked the concept he questioned whether another storage facility should be located within such close proximity to other storage facilities.

JEFF WRIGHT, Richmond, reminded the Board of strong vocal opposition to the project and identified ten letters that he would submit to the Planning Commission. He read a letter from Mayor Tom Butt into the record that had suggested the owner find a more productive use for the site that better met Richmond's needs.

DARYL HENLINE, Richmond, stated that the Santa Fe Neighborhood Council did not support the project due to its size, its location on Cutting Boulevard, and given its plan for a gateway project to the neighborhood that would be more activating for the community allowing the public to interact.

LYN SON BEAULIOU, Richmond, the agent involved in the sale of the property, expressed her concern that the complaints about the project had centered around competition for existing storage and studio space, with a focus on the storage and not on the value of the artists' exhibition space, particularly since the City had not been providing space for artists to make their living. She noted there had been no ability to discuss the issue at the Santa Fe Neighborhood Council meeting and explained that there had been no other offer for the property. She supported the proposed use which would be clean and secure and which would not generate crime.

Chair Livingston closed the public hearing.

Boardmember Neel supported the evolution of the design opening up the building to the street to be more welcoming with the stairs and entry on Cutting Boulevard; suggested the type of glass for the windows should be more open to allow artists to show off their work; liked the palette and preferred a burgundy color but could agree with a toned down green, and suggested an avocado merged with olive as previously recommended by Boardmember Butt.

With respect to the mural, it was clarified that the mural would be satisfied by the public art requirement where a local artist would perform that work.

## **MINUTES APPROVED AT THE DRB MEETING ON AUGUST 22, 2018**

Vice Chair Leader acknowledged that while it was not the DRB's purpose to discuss on land use, there should be a way to ensure that the studios would be used by artists as opposed to being used for storage. Staff explained that a condition of approval could require the use of that space by artists.

The applicant clarified that there was complete flexibility in the use of the area for the artist studios and would reach out to the art community to determine what would be the best use by that community. There was no intent to use that area for storage. It was the applicant's desire to have that space used by creative people. It was also clarified that the building had been designed with a solid block between the artist studio and the self-storage facility itself. The applicant had met with the City's Public Art Advisory Committee to identify the need for artist studios as part of its marketing for the project.

Boardmember Hannah recognized the compelling arguments on both sides, sympathized with the opponents, but explained that unless there was a public/private partnership to acquire the site and bring in another project, the subject application was what had been submitted to the DRB for review and consideration. He suggested another gas station or a setback strip mall could invite problems while the proposal would fill out the entire block and offer a presence.

Vice Chair Leader spoke to the landscape plan and recommended larger trees, that the palm trees be 18 feet of clear trunk, and that the openings be clearly framed at the corner of Cutting Boulevard and Second Street where a sixth palm tree could be added to complete the frontage. He suggested that something be done to accentuate the entry by using gravel or planting opposite the entry stairways, that the walkway along Cutting Boulevard be widened, the width of the planting be increased, and there be an eight-foot sidewalk along the front of the building.

VERNON WHITMORE, President of the Santa Fe Neighborhood Council, expressed concern that the residents had not been involved in the review of the proposal and the changes being considered to the site plan.

An unidentified neighbor to the site expressed concern for not being apprised of the proposal and the changes that were being considered to that proposal.

Boardmember Hannah referred to a huge white corner at the top and recommended that the mural be shifted to create a recess to break up some of the all-white stucco. He sketched a plan to address that concern but after the DRB had discussed the materials and the options, with no obvious architectural finessing of the corner, he suggested it was fine as is. After four iterations, he stated the design had been significantly improved and did not look like a storage building.

Boardmember Neel recommended taking the shade of the two greys a grade down to avoid the bright contrast.

Chair Livingston requested that the lighting be dropped to 3,000k throughout to fit into the City's standards. With respect to the trash enclosure, he recommended a top on the enclosure to avoid off-site dumping, and verified that the material supporting the canopies would be steel.

Chair Livingston reopened public hearing.

An unidentified speaker asked about signage which had not been shown on the plans, and the applicant explained that a signage plan would be provided based on a third-party vendor which would be done separately by that vendor.

## MINUTES APPROVED AT THE DRB MEETING ON AUGUST 22, 2018

Another unidentified speaker explained that he owned the building next door, was in the process of remodeling, and preferred a better view from his second story. The speaker also noted that he had not been notified of the application. Staff reminded the speaker that the item would also be considered by the Planning Commission.

Chair Livingston closed the public hearing.

**ACTION: It was M/S/C (Hannah/Leader) to recommend PLN18-053 Self-Storage and Artist Studios Building to the Planning Commission for approval subject to the four DRB findings and 17 staff recommended conditions of approval, and additional DRB recommendations as follows: 18) Clear glass, low iron glass to be used at the Cutting Boulevard storefront; 19) Tone down the green to something between the wasabi green and the green in the current submittal, erring on the side of the most recent green; 20) The mural to be part of the Public Art Regulations; 21) Recommend condition of approval by the Planning Commission that would guarantee that the artists' studios are rented to artist studios and not allowed to be storage units; 22) Require 24-inch box for the trees, and 18-foot clear trunk for the palm trees; 23) Trees to frame the two stair openings on Cutting Boulevard; 24) Add a sixth palm tree on the corner; 25) Create a pathway from the entry to the face of curb; 26) Add achillea or equivalent in 15 gallon; 27) Install eight-foot sidewalk from face of curb; 28) Provide galvanized all steel fittings and canopies and components; 29) Add three more trees to match existing trees on Third Street; 30) Trash enclosure to have CMU walls with corrugated metal with swing doors to match that on the building and metal fascia roof so that the trash enclosure is secured and covered; 31) LED lights to be no greater than 3,000k; and 32) Steel fence is not chain link; approved by voice vote: 4-0 (Ayes: Hannah, Leader, Livingston, and Neel; Noes: None; Absent: Benz, Butt, and Khatri).**

The next item was continued to the meeting on August 22, 2018.

- |                     |  |
|---------------------|--|
| <b>4. PLN18-070</b> | <b>MONTES SINGLE FAMILY RESIDENCE AND ADU</b>  |
| Description         | PUBLIC HEARING TO CONSIDER A REQUEST FOR A DESIGN REVIEW PERMIT TO CONSTRUCT A NEW TWO-STORY SINGLE FAMILY RESIDENCE, AND A <u>+579</u> SQUARE FOOT DETACHED ACCESSORY DWELLING UNIT ON A VACANT LOT   |
| Location            | 852 9 <sup>TH</sup> STREET   |
| APN                 | 534-032-007  |
| Zoning              | RL-2, SINGLE-FAMILY LOW DENSITY RESIDENTIAL DISTRICT   |
| Applicant           | SERGIO MONTES (OWNER)  |
| Staff Contact       | JONELYN WHALES Recommendation: <b>CONTINUE TO AUGUST 22, 2018</b>  |
| <br>                |  |
| <b>5. PLN18-081</b> | <b>ORDONEZ NEW RESIDENCE</b>   |
| Description         | ( <b>CONTINUED FROM JULY 25, 2018</b> ) PUBLIC HEARING TO CONSIDER A REQUEST FOR A DESIGN REVIEW PERMIT TO CONSTRUCT A <u>+2,212</u> SQUARE FOOT SINGLE FAMILY RESIDENCE ON A 31,095 SQUARE FOOT VACANT PARCEL IN THE CARRIAGE HILLS SUBDIVISION |
| Location            | 5401 HACKNEY LANE  |
| APN                 | 432-142-006  |
| Zoning              | RH, SINGLE FAMILY HILLSIDE RESIDENTIAL   |
| Applicant           | COREY ORDONEZ (DESIGNER)   |
| Staff Contact       | JONELYN WHALES Recommendation: <b>CONDITIONAL APPROVAL</b>   |

## MINUTES APPROVED AT THE DRB MEETING ON AUGUST 22, 2018

Jonelyn Whales presented the staff report dated August 8, 2018, for the construction of a new single-family residence on a vacant lot where a landslide from the upper slope had damaged the prior home that had to be demolished and removed. The application had been continued from the July 25, 2018 meeting for revised plans to define the porch and the entry to the dwelling, reduce the size of the gable vents, eliminate the trim around the door, align the windows along the front and provide a transition from the stucco to the siding, and utilize a lightweight concrete tile for the roof. The applicant had worked with Boardmember Hannah regarding the roof materials.

COREY ORDONEZ, the property owner, highlighted all the recommendations that the DRB had presented at the last meeting and explained how those recommendations had been addressed in the revised plans. He presented the landscape plan and an amended exhibit for the color palette, where taupe with a white trim had been provided as recommended.

Vice Chair Leader clarified with respect to the landscape plan that the garden referenced on the plans would likely be raised beds although no specific location had yet been determined. When told that bark and irrigated raised beds had been proposed, he recommended that fire-resistant bark be considered. Pea gravel was also recommended. A lawn had still been proposed for the front yard.

Boardmember Neel characterized the color palette as much improved. She clarified that the windows had been changed as recommended, as had the lights, although she noted that the back door had not been centered.

Boardmember Hannah recommended that there be no points on the six-foot high redwood fence. He was pleased that the plastic roof had been replaced, stated the vents looked much better, liked the combined trim on the front and suggested the same strategy on the left and rear elevations, and noted that the entry canopy seemed to work.

Chair Livingston thanked the applicant for the revisions to the plans, suggested there needed to be something more for the porch, referred to pre-cast PVC columns, and sketched an exhibit to place columns in a way to enhance the porch.

Boardmembers discussed options for the porch and Boardmember Hannah recommended following the plan, providing double columns, the engaged columns, and the entablature idea and finding the most simple Doric column style with a base to create a nice entry.

Chair Livingston opened the public hearing.

### Public Comments

There were no comments from the public.

Chair Livingston closed the public hearing.

**ACTION: It was M/S/C (Hannah/Leader) to approve PLN18-081, Ordonez New Residence, subject to the four DRB findings and 13 staff recommended conditions of approval (with a correction to the typo under Condition 13 to remove the strikeout for “defend”), and additional DRB recommendations as follows: 14) No stucco slivers of field material, and consolidate trims; 15) Utilize the Chair’s sketches identified as Exhibit A plan and photograph for the entry for double columns and engaged columns per the plan, with a**

## **MINUTES APPROVED AT THE DRB MEETING ON AUGUST 22, 2018**

similar more simplified column and entablature as shown in the image, with the columns to have bases; and 16) Trees to be 24-inch box and all shrubs to be a minimum of 5 gallon; approved by voice vote; 4-0 (Ayes: Hannah, Leader, Livingston, and Neel; Noes: None; Absent: Benz, Butt, and Khatri).

### **Board Business**

**A. Staff reports, requests, or announcements:** None

**B. Boardmember reports, requests, or announcements:**

Projects in progress and being considered by the DRB Subcommittee were highlighted and ways to simplify and facilitate the process for all involved, including the public, were noted.

The DRB requested that the room be configured more appropriately with respect to seating and that the number of staff recommended conditions be shown on the front page of each staff report.

### **Adjournment**

The meeting was adjourned at 8:00 P.M. to the next regular Design Review Board meeting on Wednesday, August 22, 2018.