

DESIGN REVIEW BOARD MEETING
Multipurpose Room, Civic Center Building, Basement Level
450 Civic Center Plaza, Richmond CA 94804
July 25, 2012
6:00 p.m.

BOARD MEMBERS

Don Woodrow, Chair	Raymond Welter, Vice Chair
Andrew Butt	Brenda Munoz
Eileen Whitty	Robin Welter
Mike Woldemar	

Chair Woodrow called the meeting to order at 6:00 p.m.

ROLL CALL

Present: Chair Don Woodrow; Vice Chair Raymond Welter, Boardmembers Brenda Munoz, Robin Welter, Eileen Whitty, and Michael Woldemar

Absent: None

Staff Present: Jonelyn Whales, Hector Lopez, Kieron Slaughter and Carlos Privat

APPROVAL OF AGENDA

ACTION: It was M/S (Whitty/Woldemar) to approve the Agenda; unanimously approved.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES - None

Public Forum - Brown Act - None

CONSENT CALENDAR:

Chair Woodrow noted the agenda consists of four Consent Calendar items. He asked if any members of the Board, staff, or audience wished to remove that item.

Boardmember Woldemar requested removal of Item 2. He referred to Item 3 and asked why there were two doors and a wall down the middle on the plans. Mr. Slaughter confirmed the plans will not include an internal wall separation. Boardmember Woldemar confirmed that the roof would also need to be removed and replaced for a lower section. Chair Woodrow noted the site plan does not show setbacks and he asked and confirmed that the shed is 5 feet from the property line, and the applicant reduced the height. There is no provision for height on the rear setback and the maximum height is now 12'6" in the rear.

He announced that any decision approved may be appealed in writing to the City Clerk within ten (10) days, or by Monday, August 6, 2012 by 5:00 p.m.

ACTION: It was M/S (Whitty/Robin Welter) to approve the Consent Calendar consisting of Items 1, 3 and 4; unanimously approved.

Items Approved on the Consent Calendar:

CC 1. PLN12-148 COMMERCIAL RENOVATION AND ADDITION ON HILLTOP DRIVE
Description **(Held Over from 7/11/2012)** REQUEST FOR DESIGN REVIEW APPROVAL FOR THE RENOVATION AND EXPANSION OF AN EXISTING RETAIL CENTER, INCLUDING EXPANDING BUILDINGS, LANDSCAPE AND PARKING LOT IMPROVEMENTS, AND CONSIDERATION OF A DRIVE-THROUGH WINDOW FOR AN EATING ESTABLISHMENT.
Location 4261 HILLTOP DRIVE
APN 426-292-025
Zoning C-1 (NEIGHBORHOOD COMMERCIAL DISTRICT)
Applicant HARI KALRA, OWNER
Architect JOHNSON LYMAN ARCHITECTS
Staff Contact HECTOR LOPEZ Recommendation: **HOLD OVER TO 8/22/2012**

CC 3. PLN12-132 AGUAYO ACCESSORY STRUCTURE ON CHANSLOR AVENUE
Description REQUEST FOR DESIGN REVIEW APPROVAL TO LEGALIZE AN EXISTING ±682 SQUARE FOOT ACCESSORY STRUCTURE.
Location 330 CHANSLOR AVENUE
APN 538-370-007
Zoning SFR-3 (SINGLE-FAMILY LOW DENSITY RESIDENTIAL)
Owner ANTONIO AGUAYO
Applicant NORTHCAL CONSTRUCTION, DESIGNER
Staff Contact KIERON SLAUGHTER Recommendation: **CONDITIONAL APPROVAL**

CC 4. PLN12-147 REYNOLDS RESIDENTIAL REMODEL AND RENOVATION ON OCEAN AVE
Description REQUEST FOR DESIGN REVIEW BOARD APPROVAL TO REMODEL AND RENOVATE AN EXISTING DWELLING THAT EXCEEDS 15 FEET IN HEIGHT,
AND PROVIDE A SUSTAINABLE STRUCTURE THAT UTILIZES GREEN PRACTICES AND MATERIALS.
Location 841 OCEAN AVENUE
APN 558-233-006
Zoning SFR-2 (SINGLE-FAMILY VERY LOW DENSITY RESIDENTIAL)
Owner DEBORAH REYNOLDS
Applicant CATE LEGER
Staff Contact JONELYN WHALES Recommendation: **HOLD OVER TO 8/22/2012**

Item Removed from the Consent Calendar:

CC 2. PLN12-179 SMOTHERS RESIDENTIAL REMODEL AND ADDITION ON S. 59TH STREET
Description REQUEST FOR DESIGN REVIEW APPROVAL TO REMODEL AND EXPAND THE FLOOR AREA OF AN EXISTING SINGLE-FAMILY RESIDENCE, INCLUDING THE CONSTRUCTION OF A NEW SECONDARY DWELLING UNIT.
Location 1511 S 59TH STREET
APN 508-372-012

Zoning SFR-3 (SINGLE-FAMILY LOW DENSITY RESIDENTIAL)
Owner DARRELL AND SHARON SMOTHERS
Applicant MICHAEL WOLDEMAR, ARCHITECT
Staff Contact HECTOR LOPEZ Recommendation: **CONDITIONAL APPROVAL**

Recused:

Boardmember Woldemar recused himself from participating on the item.

Hector Lopez gave the staff report and a brief description of the request for design review approval to remove and expand the floor area of an existing single family residence. He noted the lot is large, the remodel and addition will improve the property and the applicant is present for questions.

Chair Woodrow questioned parking, and Mr. Lopez stated two parking spaces are required; one for the existing non-conforming dwelling and an additional space for the second dwelling. The design proposes a new parking garage with two parking spaces and one space in the front yard, and landscaping is provided in front of the yard parking space.

Assistant City Attorney Carlos Privat clarified that Boardmember Woldemar is able to make the presentation on behalf of the client, but cannot participate in the vote.

Chair Woodrow reported the inability for people to hear the Board, and he asked that microphones be located on the table in the meeting room.

Michael Woldemar, Applicant/Architect, said he is representing owners Darrell and Sharon Smothers. He distributed a set of existing colored photographs of the house showing all directions. He described the proposal, the lot's configuration and size of over 9,000 square feet of land area, its location, topography and views, trees, rock garden, the fire which occurred that caused some structural damage, and removal of all interior finishes in the house and creating two additions to the house; one to the eastern end and one on the north side. On the southwest corner there is a new raised patio area with a corner set of French doors with views of the Golden Gate Bridge. Included in the plan is some reworking of the front driveway, additional landscaping to the east and north side, rear yard and side yard landscaping will be done in the future, and he anticipates the northwestern corner being used as a garden.

Mr. Woldemar referred to the existing house conditions, noting it is a standard two-bedroom house with a wonderful living area framed with a loft. He presented the ground floor, lower floor plan, garage on the east side, walkway coming to a half level entry going up to the main floor or back down into the garage and workshop space, an entry porch and French doors to the secondary dwelling unit which has a kitchen, living room, bathroom, short hallway into a bedroom. He said right now the secondary unit has a door that connects it to the workshop and the workshop accesses the main dwelling unit. He described the public area of the house intended as a formal living and dining area, the kitchen, breakfast area and family area leading out to a patio. They will take the vaulted ceiling and continue it over the kitchen for one continuous space.

He then described the second floor plan, roof plan, stating they extended the roof out to the front and over the north side so they all look like they were always there. They will re-roof the entire roof with composition shingle and he confirmed with Chair Woodrow that there was very little fire damage to the roof. He presented and described the front elevation, exterior materials and colors, pop-out elements around the house, window configuration, back patio, the north elevation of the second unit and entry, actual paint samples noting there are colors of sand, tan, cream, accents of terra cotta. All concrete work will be done in a terra cotta color.

He said comments were received from the Richmond Annex Neighborhood Council. He met with the subcommittee and suggested there be four additional conditions for the project which he distributed to the Board. He read them into the record, as follows:

9. Prior to the submittal for a building permit, the words “designated second unit parking space” would be added to the open parking space that is indicated on Sheet A.1 of the drawings. The open parking near the garage would be designated as a secondary unit parking space.
10. Prior to submitting for a building permit, the words “secondary dwelling unit” be added to the lower floor bedroom on Sheet A.4 to indicate it is part of the secondary unit, which fits right inside the 636 square feet.
11. Prior to submitting for a building permit, door #3 on the lower floor plan, which is between the workshop and the secondary unit, be eliminated.
12. Prior to submitting for a building permit, they will revise the plot plan and landscape plan on Sheet 1 of the drawings to reflect the revisions indicated on the attached sketch plan which includes additional landscape area, reduced pavement area, minor adjustment to the open space parking area location and the addition of a double gated entry trellis/fence to create a better sense of entry to the front door. The final plot plan and landscape plan will be subject to review and approval by the Planning Director.

Mr. Woldemar noted these conditions respond to items listed in the Richmond Annex Neighborhood Council’s letter. He stated Mr. Smothers was able to contact ten neighbors who have reviewed the project and all have indicated their approval of the plan, which he distributed.

Chair Woodrow referred to the sketch of the plan and asked if someone would have trouble getting their car parked based on the bulb-out. Mr. Woldemar said no and he described the configuration noting that visitors or guests would need to park down the street.

Boardmember Robin Welter asked for comments on the concept of the second dwelling unit and why the entrance is on the side. Mr. Woldemar said the ordinance states it cannot be prominent to the front yard. He also wanted to make it serve as the entry porch so a chair can be put out. He also did not want to make the entrance close to the utility area if moved back.

Vice Chair Raymond Welter liked the location stating it provides for a nice sense of a yard in the back. Mr. Woldemar also noted there is some grade differential.

Boardmember Robin Welter noted that if the kitchen is flipped, it would have a nice view, and Mr. Woldemar discussed the various water and hill views.

The public hearing was opened.

Public Comments:

Ms. Propp indicated that she has lived at her home since 1925 and they built her home 62 years ago. She could not have asked for a better neighbor and supported the plan. She briefly described the property’s history, stating when her house was built directly south of this property, it was to be built on the front stairs of Mr. Smothers’ house. She noted the 7, 25 foot lots that she had to purchase in order to build her home and they ended up giving them the north 25 feet of two of her lots in exchange for the front 77 feet of former Judge McKinnon’s old lot.

The public hearing was closed.

Boardmember Robin Welter said she appreciates the additional landscaping which gives it a sense of enclosure on the corner. She noted that the Chinese Pistache trees are beautiful but will get very large. Mr. Woldemar noted that his intent is for them to arch over the entry. Boardmember Welter said she felt they were too big for the corner and would obscure any view in the corner. She suggested going with two smaller trees. She suggested pulling one out from the wall, possibly changing it to something more ornamental like a Maple or a Pear. The entry could be highlighted with the same color. She said she loves the gate idea and suggested mimicking a portion of it in another area. She asked and Mr. Woldemar confirmed that he could change the radius from 2 feet to a 6 foot radius to make the drive smoother. Based on comments from neighbors, the parking spot was their main concern and trying to get out, as well as enhancing the entry, which has been done.

ACTION: It was M/S (Raymond Welter/Robin Welter) to approve PLN12-179 with the four design review findings and conditions 1 through 8, along with the additional 4 conditions as stated in the record to address the neighborhood council's concerns; unanimously approved (Woldemar recused).

Noted Present:

Boardmember Woldemar returned to participate in the remainder of the meeting.

BOARD BUSINESS:

A. Staff reports, requests, or announcements

Boardmember Woldemar indicated that the Board was to have a discussion about signage and landscape parking.

Ms. Whales apologized and said they were advised by legal that it must be publicly agendized for discussion. The item will be carried over and agendized for the next meeting.

Boardmember Woldemar asked for Mr. Mitchell to also update the Board as to upcoming projects, and Ms. Whales said she will request his attendance for an update at the next meeting on August 22nd, which should be agendized. She also announced that there are currently no items for August 8th and that meeting will be canceled.

Boardmember Whitty reported that she will be absent for the August 22nd meeting.

B. Board member reports, requests, or announcements

1. Election of New Officers

Boardmember Whitty stated the Nominating Committee has a proposed slate and recommends Ray Welter as Chair and Brenda Munoz as Vice Chair. She asked for any nominations from the floor, and there were none.

ACTION: It was M/S (Woldemar/Raymond Welter) to close nominations; unanimously approved.

ACTION: It was M/S (Woldemar/Whitty) to approve the Nominating Committee's recommendation and elect Raymond Welter as Chair and Brenda Munoz as Vice Chair; unanimously approved.

Boardmembers thanked outgoing Chair Woodrow and outgoing Vice Chair Raymond Welter for their service.

Chair Woodrow reported that he will term out on July 30, 2013 after having served 7 years.

Adjournment:

The Board adjourned at 6:50 p.m. to the next meeting on Wednesday, August 22, 2012.